



Early Journal Content on JSTOR, Free to Anyone in the World

This article is one of nearly 500,000 scholarly works digitized and made freely available to everyone in the world by JSTOR.

Known as the Early Journal Content, this set of works include research articles, news, letters, and other writings published in more than 200 of the oldest leading academic journals. The works date from the mid-seventeenth to the early twentieth centuries.

We encourage people to read and share the Early Journal Content openly and to tell others that this resource exists. People may post this content online or redistribute in any way for non-commercial purposes.

Read more about Early Journal Content at <http://about.jstor.org/participate-jstor/individuals/early-journal-content>.

JSTOR is a digital library of academic journals, books, and primary source objects. JSTOR helps people discover, use, and build upon a wide range of content through a powerful research and teaching platform, and preserves this content for future generations. JSTOR is part of ITHAKA, a not-for-profit organization that also includes Ithaka S+R and Portico. For more information about JSTOR, please contact support@jstor.org.

In a compendium of this sort that deals with such a vast amount of details a few lapses are inevitable. On p. 5, Thompson's *Handbook of Greek and Latin Palaeography* is cited in the second edition (1894); the third edition appeared in 1906 and the fourth, which has just been published, has been announced for some time; p. 33, Bretholz seems to adhere to the old view that Cassiodore was a Benedictine; p. 61, n. 5, Westwood's *Facsimiles of the Miniatures and Ornaments of Anglo-Saxon and Irish Manuscripts* (London 1868) should be mentioned along with the Palaeographical Society as furnishing "das reichste und schönste Material an Proben irisch-angelsächsischer Schrift insularer Provenienz"; p. 97, the practice of putting strokes over two *i*'s began in the eleventh century rather than the twelfth; p. 110, the Salzburg Computus of 1143 is not, as Bretholz states, the earliest European manuscript that contains Arabic numerals; neither is it, as Steffens claims (*Lateinische Paläographie*, Einleitung, p. xxxix), the earliest German manuscript containing them. Hill, "Early Use of Arabic Numerals in Europe" (*Archaeologia*, LXII [1910], 170, 171), cites MSS from Madrid, Zürich (St. Gall), Erlangen (Altdorf), Rome, Chartres, and Paris that are older. A few misprints occur: p. 34, read "library" for "liberey"; p. 38, read "Glauning" for "Glanning"; p. 39, read "Van den Gheyn" for "Van den Ghein"; p. 55, read "Jarrow" for "Tarrow"; p. 61, the English word "and" (= *et*) has crept into the text.

CHARLES H. BEESON

The Apostolic Fathers. With an English Translation by KIRSOPP LAKE. In two volumes. ("Loeb Classical Library.") New York: Macmillan, 1912. Pp. viii+409; 396. \$1.50 each.

The writings of the Apostolic Fathers fill two volumes of the "Loeb Classical Library." The work of Professor Kirsopp Lake in editing them is of the scholarly standard to be desired in presenting for the first time in a really accessible form for general reading works so important for the early history of Christianity. The first volume contains the two Epistles to the Corinthians ascribed to Clement of Rome, the seven genuine Epistles of Ignatius, the Epistle of Polycarp to the Philippians, the Teaching of the Twelve Apostles, and the Epistle of Barnabas; and the Shepherd of Hermas, the Martyrdom of Polycarp, and the Epistle to Diognetus make up the second. The introductions, giving in each case a summary of information about the author and the manuscripts of the work, are carefully and concisely written. The text, as the editor informs us, has been revised, and enough of the variants have been noted for an edition of this kind; in cases where there has evidently been corruption and the true reading is in doubt, he usually prints the suggested emendations at the bottom of the page and in the translation gives what the context most probably calls for. In I Clement 44:6, for example, *ἐκ τῆς ἀμέμπτως*

αὐτοῖς τετιμημένης λειτουργίας is translated "from the ministry which they fulfilled blamelessly," with Lightfoot's emendation of τετιμημένης to τετηρημένης noted.

The translation, however, is the really important part of a volume of the Loeb series. In this particular case the editor is to be congratulated on his accuracy; but the criticism can justly be made that sometimes through close following of the text his translation has lost in the qualities of flexibility and life. This is more noticeable in the first volume than in the second, and is no doubt due to the style of the original. Where the Greek style is jerky, as in the Epistles of Ignatius, the translation shows, perhaps rightly, the same qualities; but in the more smoothly flowing Shepherd, for example, the English too has more grace. The editor has apparently taken the King James Version of the Bible to a certain extent as a model, though not entirely, even in the scriptural quotations; however, "I cannot away with your new moons and sabbaths" (Barnabas 2:5; 15:8) may prove disconcerting to those who do not recall the obsolete expression of the King James translators. As a specimen section of the translation, Ignatius *ad Rom.* 8 may be cited: "I no longer desire to live after the manner of men, and this shall be, if you desire it. Desire it, in order that you also may be desired. I beg you by this short letter; believe me. And Jesus Christ shall make this plain to you, that I am speaking the truth. He is the mouth which cannot lie, by which the Father has spoken truly. Pray for me that I may attain. I write to you not according to the flesh but according to the mind of God. If I suffer, it was your favour; if I be rejected, it was your hatred." It will be seen that Professor Lake strives to write in an extremely simple manner and to translate literally. The result is admirable from the utilitarian point of view if not from that of English style.

Though in most passages the meaning of which might be disputed Professor Lake has indicated in a footnote other possible translations, he has made no such comment upon perhaps the best-known expression of Ignatius, ὁ ἐμὸς ἔρως ἐσταυρῶται κτλ. (Ignatius *ad Rom.* 7:2). This he translates, "My lust is crucified, and there is in me no fire of love for material things," without informing the reader that Origen (*Prol. in cant. cantic.*) understood ἔρως to be used in the sense of "object of affection" and to refer to Christ, and that among modern scholars the late Dr. Bigg in a recent work (*The Origins of Christianity*, Oxford, 1909, p. 106) interprets it in the same way.

In very few places, however, would one care to question the accuracy of Professor Lake's translation. In the Epistle to Diognetus, 7:3, "Yes, but did he send him, as a man might suppose, in sovereignty and fear and terror?" ἐπὶ τυραννίδι would perhaps be better rendered by "with a view to," etc. Certainly in the Shepherd, *Sim.* V. 6. 5: τὸ πνεῦμα τὸ ἅγιον τὸ προόν κτλ., where the text agrees with that in the *corpus Patrum Apostolicorum*, the English translation, "The Holy Spirit which goes forth," is in

error. But these faults are few. There are, however, too many typographical errors in Vol. II; I have noted no less than 23 which have escaped the proofreader's eye.

It should also be noted that the "General Index" and Index of Scriptural References at the end of the second volume add much to the usefulness of the work. The one thing to be regretted in the physical appearance of this handy little edition is that the lines are not spaced uniformly from page to page. Otherwise it is well adapted to its purpose and deserves wide circulation.

FRANK EGLESTON ROBBINS

UNIVERSITY OF MICHIGAN

The Governors of Moesia. By SELATIE EDGAR STOUT. Dissertation. Princeton University, 1911. Pp. xii+97. \$0.75.

Scholars of the last generation were all too prone to underrate the individuality of different parts of the Roman world. Now we are coming to realize the need of minute investigations of each province in order to understand the empire as a whole. The historian and the epigraphist are as helpless without an up-to-date prosopographia and accurate chronological tables as the student of literature without a lexicon. Dr. Stout, therefore, is doing useful work when he discusses the evidence for identifying and dating the governors of Moesia. He was particularly fortunate in his choice of province and topic, since a large proportion of the material relating to the Danubian country has been discovered in recent years and is still practically unworked. Thus the original form of the third volume of the *Corpus inscriptionum Latinarum* (1873) contained only 41 pages devoted to Moesia; the supplements appearing up to 1902 add no fewer than 116 pages. The coins of the region also were made more accessible by Pick's publication in 1899. But though the army of the province has been studied within the last decade by Beuchel, Filow, and Van der Weerd, no thoroughgoing attempt has been made to discuss the civil officials since the very unsatisfactory treatment by Liebenam in 1888.

The reviewer has nothing but praise for the accuracy and skill with which Dr. Stout has performed his laborious task. The citations from the sources are exhaustive, the reasoning sane and independent, the external form beyond reproach. The reader's convenience is consulted by a brief conspectus of the 106 certain governors (pp. 82-85), an *index nominum et rerum*, and an *index verborum* citing 339 inscriptions and 162 passages of 34 authors. One's chief regret is that the historical introduction (pp. ix-xi) is so condensed. For example, Dr. Stout believes that after its conquest by Crassus in 29-28 B.C. Moesia was controlled for a time by native princes but was probably organized as a province several years before 6 A.D.; we should have liked a more detailed presentation of these points, with the evidence for and